

Mapping 'new' geographies of religion: politics and poetics in modernity

Lily Kong

Department of Geography, National University of Singapore, 1 Arts Link, Singapore 117570

Abstract: This article reviews geographical research on religion in the 1990s, and highlights work from neighbouring disciplines where relevant. Contrary to views that the field is incoherent, I suggest that much of the literature pays attention to several key themes, particularly, the politics and poetics of religious place, identity and community. I illustrate the key issues, arguments and conceptualizations in these areas, and suggest various ways forward. These 'new' geographies emphasize different sites of religious practice beyond the 'officially sacred'; different sensuous sacred geographies; different religions in different historical and place-specific contexts; different geographical scales of analysis; different constitutions of population and their experience of and effect on religious place, identity and community; different dialectics (socio-spatial, public-private, politics-poetics); and different moralities.

Key words: community, identity, modernity, place, poetics, politics, religion.

I Introduction

In this article, I scrutinize a facet of life that has spawned a large literature across the social sciences and humanities, and attracted significant attention in the last decade within geography – religion. Strangely, however, as an area of geographical inquiry, it continues in a misunderstood way to be labelled as depleted, purportedly attracting few thinkers (Sinha, 1995a: 1), lacking in coherence, and existing in disarray (Livingstone, 1994: 373; Raivo, 1997a: 137). Such a characterization has persisted, even two to three decades after this chaotic atomism was first said to characterize the field (Tuan, 1976; Sopher, 1981). Oddly, too, cultural geographical texts from different parts of the globe in recent years have either given it scant, uneven or no attention at all (see, for example, Duncan and Ley, 1993; Shurmer-Smith and Hannam, 1994; Crang, 1998; Anderson and Gale, 1999).¹ Otherwise, they have signalled the importance of religion

(for example, Jackson, 1989), but have left others to elaborate; or have focused primarily on environmental theology (Foote *et al.*, 1994). In many instances, in the same breath that race, class and gender are invariably invoked and studied as ways by which societies are fractured, religion is forgotten or conflated with race. Here, I will argue that the field does not deserve existing evaluations of incoherence, that it is in fact distinguished by rich diversity, yet simultaneously significant coherence, albeit a theoretical coherence that I read into the range of empirical work from an a posteriori position. I will also argue that religion deserves to be acknowledged fully and in like manner alongside race, class and gender in geographical analysis. Most significantly, I underline the geographic significance of examining religion, not least in the intersection of sacred and secular forces in the making of place. This is especially so in urban contexts where the sacred and secular and, indeed, varieties of the sacred, frequently exist cheek by jowl. Theories of urban space and society must take on board integrally the ways in which socially constructed religious places overlap, complement or conflict with secular places and other socially constructed religious places in the allocation of use and meaning. In this regard, I will draw attention to how, at the material, symbolic and ideological levels, the separation between sacred and secular is more fluid than rigid, and how urban theories must acknowledge this mutability. Even while the sacred is often constructed, and gathers meaning in opposition to the secular, place is often multivalent, and requires an acknowledgement of simultaneous, fluctuating and conflicting investment of sacred and secular meanings in any one site.

Here, I examine geographical research on religion, paying particular attention to work done in the last decade since I reviewed the field (Kong, 1990). While one major attempt has been made to document such research since then (Park, 1994), it does not concern itself with new directions (of spirituality, cultural politics, personal experience, symbolism, for example), remaining extremely competent in dealing with traditional concerns, for example, of distribution, diffusion and dynamics of religion, and the relationship between religion, demography and development (see Kong, 1995). Another review by Raivo (1997a) reproduced standing critiques. In this article, I draw on perspectives from neighbouring disciplines – anthropology, comparative religion, sociology, politics, history, theology – to suggest agendas for 'new' geographies of religion that take account of religion in modernity, with its differentiations and dedifferentiations (Heelas, 1998). I take on board efforts to think through new research agendas (Bhardwaj, 1991; Cooper, 1992), focusing primarily on questions about what happens to sacredness, religious and sacred space, identity and community in modernity. I will do so by adopting the dyad of the politics and poetics of sacred place, identity and community. While convenient as a conceptual dichotomy, I emphasize the interconnectedness of politics/poetics, private/public, social/spatial, using the first pair merely as a springboard for discussion of all the cross-cutting relationships.

II The politics and poetics of the sacred

Chidester and Linenthal (1995: 5) draw parallels between the politics and poetics of the sacred with the situational and substantial sacred. Citing Durkheim, they argue that the sacred is situational because it is 'at the nexus of human practices and social projects'. Hence, 'nothing is inherently sacred' (Chidester and Linenthal, 1995: 6). Similarly, Levi-

Strauss has emphasized that the sacred is 'a value of indeterminate signification, in itself empty of meaning and therefore susceptible to the reception of any meaning whatsoever' (Chidester and Linenthal, 1995: 6). The sacred is thus tied up with, and draws meaning from, social and political relationships. In contrast, the 'substantial' sacred parallels the poetics of the sacred. Here, the 'sacred' is thought to have an 'essential character' (Chidester and Linenthal, 1995: 5).

1 Politics of space

... a sacred space is not merely discovered, or founded, or constructed; it is claimed, owned, and operated by people advancing specific interests (Chidester and Linenthal, 1995: 15).

Sacred space is contested space, just as the sacred is a 'contested category' (Needham, cited in Chidester and Linenthal, 1995: 15). The most significant aspects of sacred space are not categories, such as heaven, earth and hell, but 'hierarchical power relations of domination and subordination, inclusion and exclusion, appropriation and dispossession' (Chidester and Linenthal, 1995: 17). It is therefore important to interrogate the 'entrepreneurial, social, political and other "profane" forces' that constitute the construction of sacred space (Chidester and Linenthal, 1995: 17), which often entail 'the cultural labor of ritual, in specific historical situations, involving the hard work of attention, memory, design, construction, and control of place' (Smith, 1978: 88). Such forces may work not only towards sacralization of places but desacralization as well.

If sacredness is not inherent, attention must be paid to how place is sacralized. While some scholars have dealt with sacralization in terms of creating the poetics of sacred place (see later discussion), others have emphasized the power relations involved. Van der Leeuw (1933) identified four kinds of politics in the construction of sacred space. He outlined a politics of position whereby every establishment of a sacred place is a conquest of space; a politics of property whereby a sacred place is 'appropriated, possessed and owned', its sacredness maintained through claims and counterclaims on its ownership; a politics of exclusion, whereby the sanctity of sacred place is preserved by maintaining boundaries, carving the inside from the outside; and a politics of exile, which takes the form of a modern loss of or nostalgia for the sacred. Chidester and Linenthal (1995: 19), in turn, outline four strategies in the production and reproduction of sacred space: a strategy of appropriation, similar to van der Leeuw's politics of property; a strategy of exclusion (van der Leeuw's politics of exclusion); a strategy of inversion; and a strategy of hybridization. A strategy of inversion entails the inversion of a prevailing spatial and social order, so that the high becomes low, the inside becomes outside, the peripheral becomes central, and yet retaining subtly the basic oppositional structure (Chidester and Linenthal, 1995: 19). A strategy of hybridization involves mixing, fusing or transgressing conventional spatial relations (Chidester and Linenthal, 1995: 15–18). As in other recent cultural geographical research, space is shown to be 'fundamental in any exercise of power' (Foucault, 1984: 252).

Empirical work that applies the above comes from within geography, but also neighbouring disciplines, especially anthropology. Various politics and power relations have been explored. In conceptualizing the construction, contestation and consumption of sacred place as a circuit of culture (Johnson, 1986), the politics may be studied at various

'moments' of the circuit: in the production, management and maintenance of sacred place, consumption of meaning, and insertion into everyday lived cultures. By far, most work has focused on conflicts over meanings.

The production of sacred place and the politics therein may be illustrated by reference to three sets of works which represent distinct situations. The first, exemplifying secular-religious relations, and focusing on the 'officially sacred' (Leiris, 1938), mainly churches, temples, synagogues and mosques, illustrates the power of the secular in defining the location of religious buildings. Such secular forces may take the form of 'rational' urban planning principles, including capitalistic principles of land values, and principles of multiculturalism (see Kong, 1993a; also Rath *et al.*, 1991). On the other hand, as Kong (1993b) also illustrates, religious adherents may have other ideas about where to locate their religious buildings, following the directions of their god(s). When the power of the state transcends, religious adherents find ways of coming to terms with the primacy of the secular order. The second example illustrates majority-minority relations, and the power of the majority group to exert its wishes. Philp and Mercer (1999) describe how the majority Buddhist government in Burma manipulates religion in its desire to represent Burma as a 'harmonious Buddhist nation'. For example, land is seized from a minority Kachin Baptist organization for the construction of a new pagoda. A third example similarly examines secular-religious and majority-minority relations, this time in the context of religious schools. Dwyer and Meyer (1995) compare the institutionalization of Islam in The Netherlands and the UK by considering the establishment of state-funded Islamic schools. The article examines the intersection of the ideological constructions of 'Muslim' and 'integration' with the political decision-making process. Some argue that Islamic schools detract from integration as they will be populated largely, if not exclusively, by immigrant children. Without the mixing of children of different cultural-religious backgrounds, integration is thought to be impossible. The multicultural school, in this view, is the 'site of the creation of a multicultural society'. On the other hand, others argue that Islamic schools provide the grounds for the development of a strong sense of identity, only after which integration might occur. The authors illustrate how these negotiated notions of 'integration' inform decision-making (see also Dwyer and Meyer, 1996).

Religious places, once established, require management and maintenance. Here again, a politics is evident. The multidisciplinary heritage literature deals with many of the critical issues, often focused on the negotiation over management and maintenance of sacred places between native people who revere the sites and modern forces that want them for pragmatic, commercial or even alternative religious purposes (Carmichael *et al.*, 1994). This analysis of the politics in management and maintenance has not been given much attention by geographers and represents one avenue of research that should be opened up. What has been more abundantly researched is the nature of different meanings invested in the same sites, which lie at the heart of the politics of management and maintenance. It is to studies of such divergent meanings that I now turn.

Bowman (1993: 432) draws attention to Hertz's (1913) largely disregarded work which examines 'how a single religious site is interpreted in very different ways by discrete communities engaging there in commemorative festivities'. Hertz argues that the meaning of a holy place must be understood not in terms of the place itself but the 'social practices of the communities which revere it and the identities generated by

those activities' (Bowman, 1993: 432). This underscores much of the research in recent years. The politics surrounding meaning investment in religious places take various forms: tensions between secular and sacred meanings, inter-religious contestations in multireligious communities, politics between nations, intrareligious conflicts, and gender, class and race politics.

In conditions of modernity, sacred–secular tensions have formed a key focus of analysis. Elsewhere, I have highlighted recent work on cemeteries and crematoria which examines state discourse and practice surrounding burial and crematorial space, often hinged on secular utilitarian views of planning, adopting principles of efficient land use and taking on board concerns about sanitation, while local communities emphasized symbolic and religious meanings of graves as focal points of identity, expressions of relationships with the land and as crucial to the practice of religious beliefs and rituals (Kong, 1999a). Other types of sacred sites have also invited like analyses, such as Jacobs' (1993) focus on Aboriginal sacred sites. Jacobs illustrates the power of the map in negotiations between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Australia. Whereas indigenous peoples may not want or be able to map the precise boundaries of their land claims because of the nature of their beliefs, non-Aboriginal Australia insists on such precision (Jacobs, 1993: 111), which has become one of the mechanisms by which legitimacy of claims is established (see also Jacobs, 1996, on tensions between secular spaces of the city and the Aboriginal sacred). Tensions surrounding these sacred sites of nature are also the subject of analysis in the context of Mt Hiko in Japan, a Shugendo cultic centre in Kyushu Island. Like Jacobs, Grapard (1998: 247) argues that sacred space is the object of many competing interpretations and 'cannot be separated from social, economic and political conditions'; it cannot be 'studied separately from the communities that constructed it, challenged it, destroyed it, and provided new formulations of it over time' and is 'better seen . . . in relation to the conflicts these constructs generated, and in relation to the economy that these constructed, reflected, generated, or opposed'.

While there is a tendency to think of sacred spaces in terms of sites and locations, religious routes bear analysis as well. Graham and Murray (1997) illustrate this, focusing on the dichotomy between official and nonofficial appropriations of the pilgrimage route (not merely the site) to Santiago de Compostela, Spain. The route has been appropriated by governments of the regions through which it passes, imaging, marketing, and, hence, commodifying it. As Murray and Graham (1997) highlighted, Santiago de Compostela's dominant religious meaning as a pilgrimage destination is modified to a city of culture, where a place of prayer becomes a heritage attraction, a ritual becomes a special event of tourism, expiation is transformed to certificate of achievement, harsh pilgrim routes for penance and self-renewal become off-road adventure trails and so forth.

One of the conditions of modernity is multiple differentiations, not only between secular and sacred, but in multiplicities of religious inclinations, each seeking a primacy over the rest.² In multireligious communities, inter-religious contestations over meanings have been explored. Naylor and Ryan's (1998) study of Hindu presence in a predominantly white Christian neighbourhood in London reveals how local residents perceive the mandir (Hindu temple) to be a threat to their homes, public areas and community, and have developed new senses of territoriality. They point out that '[w]hile the majority did not want to seem prejudiced against Hindus or Indians and

recognized they had a right to build places of worship, they nevertheless seemed threatened by the development and felt that local amenities such as parking and traffic restriction were inadequate to cope' (Naylor and Ryan, 1998: 9). In other words, local residents saw the mandir to be a 'visual sign of intrusion and invasion of a predominantly white British space' (Naylor and Ryan, 1998: 9). On the other hand, for the Hindu community, the temple was part of their sense of identity, and a centre of community, with cultural, social and welfare activities, its importance underscored by the fact that while most of the Hindus had home altars, they often visited their local mandir as well.

Similarly, anthropologist Bowman (1993) presents a reading of Christian and Muslim Palestinian uses of two West Bank Christian holy places. Alive with ethnographic detail, the article shows how Palestinians of different sectarian affiliations interpret the same holy place, defining their relationship to it differently. However, the multivocality of place is reduced to a univalence when external antagonism endangers survival for all. At such times, the site/shrine 'reifies the new sense of community constituted through antagonism' (Bowman, 1993: 454; see also Friedland and Hecht, 1991).

While the above examples illustrate the tensions between different religions, Raivo (1997b) illustrates that, even within Christianity, among different traditions, similar disquietudes may be evident, which are further complicated by perceptions of political affiliations. He examines how, in Finland, the dominant Lutheran culture perceives the Orthodox religious culture, either as an acceptable national value (symbolizing 'a local religion, a sense of community and the conservative values of traditional country life' – Raivo, 1997b: 332), or an alien intrusion, associated with Russian oppression and false Christianity. In a similar way, within Hindu communities, caste differentiations have also seen struggles over meanings of places. Nagar's (1997) excellent work illustrates this in the context of postcolonial Dar es Salaam, Tanzania. Focusing on communal (religious) organizations, Nagar (1997) explores how the struggles between castes are played out in communal places. For example, the elite-dominated Hindu Mandal attempted to sustain its legitimacy as a representative body of all Hindus, using communal spaces as the 'stages' where their public narratives are enacted, organizing social events for all Hindu castes to be held in them. On the other hand, other members of the higher castes did not share the desire of the Hindu Mandal leaders to unite Hindus across castes, manifested in a high degree of intracaste socializing in caste halls, a means of marginalizing the lower castes. Elite groups also refused to attend the communal social events the Hindu Mandal organized. In turn, the counterpublic discourses of the poorer and lower-class Hindus were anchored in the claim that the Hindu Mandal only served the interests of the rich and that statements about trying to involve the poor were simply rhetoric. They criticized the upper-caste leaders as 'wealthy cheaters' who only wanted the support of the poor to further their own material interests and, similarly, stayed away from the communal events the Hindu Mandal organized.

Anthropological research has also explored like issues in patently geographical ways. Good's (1999) carefully researched work on an 1895 riot in a south Indian town focuses on the dispute between the Nadars and other local Hindus, which dwelt on the right to take wedding processions around the town's 'car streets'. These streets, built for processions of the temple deity, surround the Hindu temple and are thought to be sacralized, risking pollution by wedding and other processions, particularly by low castes. Nadar marriage processions had previously been confined to their own quarters,

but once the car streets were built, Nadars sought repeatedly to process along them, thus furthering their claims to high-caste privileges. They tried various legal ways to assert their use of the car streets but, when all else failed, they converted to Catholicism in a bid to up their status, a 'tactical "conversion" to Christianity' (Bayly, 1989: 445).

Like Good, other anthropologists have also contributed to the literature on the politics of sacred space involving intrareligious conflict over meanings, illustrating a clear rapprochement with contemporary cultural geography. This is most evident in a range of research on pilgrimages, which counters Turner's (1974) thesis that pilgrimage is a source of *communitas* in which people bond together. Instead, as Eade and Sallnow (1991) and contributors to their volume exemplify, pilgrimage is a political space which fosters struggle, an arena with not only competing religious and secular discourses, but also competing intrareligious meanings (see also Campo, 1991).

Finally, to illustrate yet another site of meaning contestation, I draw attention to McDannell's (1995: 195) discussion of home schooling as a strategy to create Christian spaces in the home, simultaneously marking the space outside the home as profane. Home schooling marks an ideology which privileges the private space of the home as the place where 'true virtue can be cultivated'. This 'domestic Christianity', McDannell (1995: 209) argues, can challenge churches because 'it defines private space as the most significantly religious space'. Whereas churches have a 'rarefied atmosphere of piety', domestic Christianity fills everyday life with the Christian spirit; and the natural family is emphasized over the church family as reflecting Christ's saving power (McDannell, 1995: 209).

Aside from contestations over meanings, the politics of religious spaces are also tied up with gender, race and class politics, and politics between nations. Patriarchy, classism and racism are often reflected in and reinforced by cemeteries, memorials and tombstones (see Kong, 1999a). Deathscapes also illustrate the constructions of nations and the politics of international relations. Whether it is about keeping a tangible colonial presence through the insistence on British war cemeteries in foreign soils (Morris, 1997), or about the language used on headstones as illustration of nationalistic allegiances (Mythum, 1994), meanings are invested in deathscapes which speak about the power relations between nations. The conflicts in Northern Ireland between Protestants and Catholics are further illustrations of conflicts between nations. As Graham (1998) illustrates, Protestants lack the necessary agreed positive representation of place and thus experience cultural ambiguity and political insecurity. This, in turn, leads them to assert control over territory as a way of seeking political security. Similarly, Shirlow and McGovern (1998) illustrate the critical value of a positive sense of place, where Sinn Fein's political strategies change only when they heighten the political recognition of the Irish sense of place and identity felt by the Catholic community.

Such analyses of the politics between 'nations' need to be extended to other sites of religious significance, including technological 'sites', from websites to audiovisual religious productions. In 1991, Stump (1991: 358) made the observation that while local Christian broadcasts had become increasingly common outside the USA in recent decades, their influence was secondary to that of international broadcasts in most areas, by which he meant those emanating from the USA. As I have highlighted elsewhere (Kong, forthcoming), various research questions need to be pursued here. For example, as technology and globalizing tendencies open up cultural borders, how are states dealing with the influence of international religious broadcasts in their countries? If

American involvement is strong in international Christian broadcasting, what are the implications for a new cultural imperialism via religion, a kind of religious imperialism?

The 'texts' produced in circuits of culture are often transformed and taken up in everyday lives, sometimes in divergent contexts. For example, religious objects in temples, churches and synagogues may be laden with sacred meaning. Yet, they may be (re)produced and appear in museums, where different meanings become invested. As Grimes (1992) points out, religious objects do not exist in a void. The spaces they inhabit can alter, even determine their meaning as well as viewers' comprehension of that meaning. In this regard, museums commoditize and singularize³ religious objects and, in the process, alter their meanings. Grimes (1992: 421–33) elaborates with the example of how installing the Hindu goddess Lakshmi in a museum is 'a performance of aesthetic values, an educational and political ceremony', which differs entirely from the meaning of Lakshmi, the sacred deity, in a temple. In the museum, the statue is 'said to refer to a myth' while in a sanctuary it 'embodies' the myth. In the museum, the curator provides information about the myths. In the sanctuary, devotees already know, and are merely reminded. Museumizing an object also removes it from its ritual use, and this strips it of its sacredness, because sacredness is also 'a function of ritual use, not just of form or of reference' (Grimes, 1992: 423). Grimes' work opens up agendas for research into the ways in which religious objects are taken into everyday lives, through museumization and the transformation of meanings, but also through other means, such as mass production of religious artifacts.

2 Poetics of place

While the political and religious are clearly integrally interconnected, the poetics of sacred place, identity and community are as much a part of people's experience of the religious. Unlike the inescapable power relations outlined earlier, such poetics is often sought after, in people's search for the immanent and transcendent, but not always experienced. Researchers have often tended to examine the politics and poetics of religion discretely, and the separate focus below on the poetics illustrates this disconnection. I will, however, return later to reintegrate the discussions.

The 'poetics', the 'substantial', the 'essential character' of religious place, assumed to be sacred place, has long drawn research attention from scholars of religion. Eliade's (1959) work immediately comes to mind: he contends that the sacred irrupts in certain places as revelations (hierophanies), causing them to become 'powerful centers of meaningful worlds', set apart from ordinary, homogeneous space. Lane (1988) crystallizes these as 'axioms' in understanding sacred place and experience. First, what Eliade suggests is an irruption, Lane characterizes as that which chooses, rather than that which is chosen. Secondly, sacred place is ordinary place, ritually made extraordinary. Thirdly, sacred place is intimately linked to states of consciousness; it is possible to go by a place numerous times without recognizing it as sacred. When one does, however, one may experience it as the 'numinous' (Otto, 1917) or through a variety of emotions not unlike ordinary happiness, anger, fear and so forth, except as directed to the religious (James, 1902; Kong, 1992). Finally, sacred place is both local and universal and therefore exerts centripetal and centrifugal forces simultaneously. Thus, one is

'recurrently driven to a quest for centeredness – a focus on the particular place of divine encounter – and then at other times driven out from that center with an awareness that God is never confined to a single locale' (Lane, 1988: 15). This parallels two general spatial orientations in the study of religion, the locative and Utopian: the former is fixed, bounded, and requires the maintenance of one's place and that of others in a larger scheme of things; the latter is unbounded and unfixed to any particular location, breaking out of a prevailing social order (Smith, 1978).

Some of these axioms are borne out but also contradicted in Japhet's (1998) attempt to clarify biblical concepts of sacred place. Like Eliade and Lane, Japhet (1998: 59) argues that, biblically, a sacred place is 'one where God reveals himself to humanity'. But unlike Lane, Japhet does not believe the Bible holds a 'Utopian' (that is, unbounded, unfixed) notion of sacred space. Instead, she shows how a sacred place in the Bible is specifically 'a place where God dwells' (Japhet, 1998: 59), 'demarcated within and limited to a particular physical and geographical area' (Japhet, 1998: 62; see also Holm and Bowker, 1994, where different types of sacred places in different religions, such as pilgrimage sites, temples/churches/ mosques/synagogues, burial places, mountains, and so forth, are discussed).

While there are some works that attempt to capture the 'spiritual essence' and poetic quality of religious places through descriptions of their religious folklore, symbols, crafts and foods (see, for example, Griffith, 1992), there are also other more theoretically engaged attempts to illustrate the poetic nature of sacred places. In a good example of anthropological work engaging with geographical ideas and giving due attention to new religious movements, Hume (1998) examines Wiccan⁴ sacred place. Wiccans recognize ancient places and prehistoric monuments (e.g., Stonehenge and Avebury) to have energies and powers, and a numinous quality which set them apart from ordinary space. Simultaneously, they have a conception of sacred place that is of the imaginary. Eschewing the politics of space, Hume (1998: 311) argues that Wiccan sacred space 'can be made without regard to geographical place or space and is not a subject for political debate over any land ownership or appropriation'. They are 'neither bounded by territorial fences nor dependent upon geographical locations' (Hume, 1998: 312). Instead, they reside in the 'world of the imagination, the *mundo imaginalis* ... the landscape of the mind' (Hume, 1998: 312). Thus, sacred place can be set up anywhere. Once the location is chosen, a Wiccan sacred circle is created at two levels, the physical and the imaginary (Hume, 1998: 315). The number of participants determines the size of the circle; the boundaries are defined by the imagination, rather than walls or ceilings. Even if space is not available, a witch may construct a circle in her mind (Hume, 1998: 318). In short, all Wiccan sacred places are created – sacralized. This calls attention to the processes of sacralization.

Hume (1998) continues, in her article, to describe the Wiccan process of sacralization, from moments of quiet meditation prior to casting a circle, to setting up the altar, laying out the witch's tools, ringing a bell to signal the commencement of the rite, and so forth. Mazumdar and Mazumdar (1993), focusing on the sacralization of the house in mainstream Hinduism, similarly emphasize the role of ritual in sacralization, purifying the outside (e.g., through consecration of the land and planting of ritually significant plants), and sacralizing the inside (e.g., through lighting the sacred fire, anointing participants with ashes from the fire, and walking a cow through the rooms).

These specific cases, of a new religious movement and mainstream religion, respec-

tively, illustrate the larger principle that Chidester and Linenthal (1995) identify as an integral part of sacralization: ritualization. Indeed, they argue that sacred place is ritual place, a location for 'formalized, repeatable symbolic performances' (Chidester and Linenthal, 1995: 9). While not immediately apparent in the above description for my lack of reproduction of ethnographic details, Chidester and Linenthal's (1995: 10) thesis holds that the human body plays a crucial role in the ritual production of sacred place because ritual action 'manipulates basic spatial distinctions between up and down, right and left, inside and outside, and so on, that necessarily revolve around the axis of the living body'. With modernity and technology, however, questions must be asked about how conceptions of sacred place alter, and the role of the living body-axis in it. For example, as cyberspace invades myriad of spheres of our lives, what happens to the maintenance of boundaries between inside and outside? What happens to the bodily axis? Are different rituals developed that perhaps emphasize the visual and kinetic less (such as ritual movement) and spotlight the aural/audio more (such as ritual songs and chants)? Might vicarious ritual action become important (performed elsewhere and watched on screen)? Will simultaneous living-room rituals develop, or ritual in the form of songs/chants involving simultaneous others elsewhere become important (see Kong, forthcoming)?

While sacred places may result from sacralization processes, landscapes are also sometimes created to replicate sacred worlds as understood by particular religious groups (Michell, 1994; Singh, 1994). This harks back to work by doyens such as Wheatley (1971), who drew attention to the desire of humankind to create macro-microcosmic parallels. It is also reflected in cosmographical maps, which make cartography 'less of a gridded stage on which life takes place and more a model of how the spiritual world and physical world interact' (Woodward and Lewis, 1998: 538). A series of volumes on the history of cartography (Harley and Woodward, 1994; Woodward and Lewis, 1992; 1998) bears this out. Examples of other recent works include a series of essays that attempt to illustrate how the values embedded in various religions are projected into the natural world, and impact the ways landscape gardens are shaped (Pan, 1995; Sinha, 1995b; Wescoat, 1995). Such works represent a thread of continuity with past writings.

Another set of works which continues a humanistic trend focuses on the attachments people develop with sacred places. Kong (1992) has explored, for example, the personal and familial histories of religious adherents in Singapore and how they are tied up with churches and Hindu temples, contributing to the development of personal attachments and senses of place. Mazumdar and Mazumdar (1993) have focused on Hindu sacred place, arguing that the domestic *pooja* area is viewed as a family heirloom and evokes a sense of rootedness. Feelings of loss, grief and mourning accompany the dismantling of sacred place. Further, they argue that emotional connectedness is created and sustained through sacred place-making. The process of creation contributes to places and objects becoming part of our self-identity, as does repeated contact, familiarity and shared experience. Learning in space also leads to identification with and attachment to space. Such research represent continuities with the humanistic work of geographers such as Tuan and Buttimer but, while they illustrate the applicability of existing concepts, have not reconceptualized our understanding of place attachments. It may suggest that attachment to religious place is little different from attachment to secular place (see James, 1902).

3 Poetics of community

Writings on community have frequently dealt with the desirability of *gemeinschaft* and its demise with modernity. Within the multidisciplinary literature on religion, much of the attention in the pre-1990s was focused on religious places such as mosques and temples as social centres where adherents gathered, not only to pray, but to engage in social activities as well. As long as people prayed in the same place and 'did things together', the assumption was often that they felt they 'belonged' together as a 'community'. Little attention was paid to the fact that 'belonging' to a parish or praying in the same place did not necessarily entail a feeling of integration and community with other worshippers. Internal tensions, while part and parcel of a community, even one sharing a sense of *gemeinschaft*, have not been explored and attention has hardly been paid to the ways in which such tensions are mediated and resolved, and how these very mediations and negotiations are often part of the process of community-building. Geographical work in the 1990s has replicated earlier trends. Although I did not make explicit use of the concept of 'community', my own earlier work provides an example of a somewhat uncritical treatment of religious places as social centres (Kong, 1992), as does Prorok (1994) in her treatment of Hindu temples in 'the western world' (primarily the USA). While it is important to understand the poetics of community, it is also crucial to interrogate the dialectics between the politics and poetics of community.

Before engaging with that agenda, though, I will spotlight another debate about the role of place in the construction of community, and to underscore its relevance to the geographical study of religion. Silk (1999: 8) provides a useful summary. He begins with the premise that 'community' usually suggests some or all of the following: common needs and goals, a sense of the common good, shared lives, culture and views of the world, and collective action. These rely on interaction and communication between community members, which are much more likely when there is unmediated face-to-face contact between people, which, in turn, means locatedness in a place (see also Hillary, 1955). However, communities may also be spatially dispersed ('place-free', 'stretched-out') (Davies and Herbert, 1993; Johnston *et al.*, 1994: 80; Knox, 1995: 214). As Silk (1999: 9) highlighted, communicative media such as the telephone and the Internet allow for the construction of communities without territorial base. Examples of such stretched-out communities might be nations (imagined communities) and ethnocultural diasporas.

Technology has influenced religious activities through religious broadcasting and computer-mediated communication (email, discussion lists, websites, etc.), for example. Such developments may have revitalized religion in some ways, rather than led to its demise, as some of the literature is wont to argue (see Kong, forthcoming). Few geographers have begun to explore these media and their impacts on religious life, including the poetics of religious communities. Colleagues in other disciplines, however, have begun to explore some of the effects of technology on the poetics and politics of religion. For example, a concern to recover the poetics of community has prompted research on whether stretched-out media-based religious 'communities' in fact share the characteristics of 'traditional', 'real' communities. There is also concomitant realization that such media are riven with power relations and political contestations at various levels (see Kong, forthcoming). Simultaneously, sceptics within geography have also questioned if cyberspace is 'space' enough for geographers to

devote research time and energy to. These critics miss the point, in my view. As I argue elsewhere (Kong, forthcoming), some of the key questions surrounding the development of cyberspace are not necessarily about whether cyberspace constitutes 'space' and therefore deserves geographical attention or not, but about what this form of technology is doing to conventional conceptions of and actions in space.

4 Politics of identity and community

Smith (1999: 25) points out that there are often overlooked limitations to 'traditional communities' as commonly conceived and reminds us they are a form of idealization. Traditional communities are often characterized by various forms of oppression, 'protecting the prevailing value system including its moral code' (Smith, 1999: 25; see also Dwyer, 1999). There is also an 'intolerance of difference', since the 'ideal of community' relies on a desire for 'the same social wholeness and identification that underlies racism and ethnic chauvinism on the one hand and political sectarianism on the other' (Young, 1990a: 303; Young, 1990b). This is precisely the differentiation within modernity that calls for absoluteness, a certainty that differences mark out what is true/false, legitimate/illegitimate, valued/not valued. Unlike postmodernity where there is no attempt to claim one tradition alone as valid, this 'intolerance of difference' in modernity has given rise to a politics of identity and community, with struggles between and within groups for power and resources.

While intergroup conflicts are manifest and have been the subject of study, two caveats must be emphasized. First, it is crucial to recognize that boundaries between groups are themselves constructed and contested. Writing in the context of ethnic groups, Eade (1991), Baumann (1996) and others have emphasized that 'ethnic communities' are imagined communities whose 'boundaries, structures and norms are the result of constant processes of struggles and negotiations' (Dwyer, 1999: 54). Secondly, difference does not only exist between communities but within communities as well; communities are not unproblematic and boundaries within are also constructed and contested (Silk, 1999: 12).

These theoretical positions have informed recent geographical work on religious 'communities'. Dwyer's (1999) work on young Muslim women in a small town near London examines the ways in which different constructions of community – both 'local' and 'globalized' – are used by young British Muslim women, which are simultaneously empowering and constraining. Participants in Dwyer's study spoke about a local 'Asian community', evoked by the availability of specialized services such as halal meat shops, which signals for them a sense of security and acceptance (hence no racism) in the town. This is a construction of an 'Asian community' that corresponds to the ethnic community discourse of conventional multiculturalism in which the 'Asian community' is imagined in opposition to 'British society'. While this was positive, it came at a cost: living in an 'Asian community' meant all sorts of surveillance by other members of the 'community' about one's actions and behaviour. This is the contradiction of community that confronts young British Muslim women. 'Community' is a source of security and strength but also of constraint and oppression.

Because the boundaries of 'community' are fluid, different imaginations of Muslim community can be evoked or denied. Dwyer (1999) explores contradictions within a

'community', with those who construct and those who deny the existence of a 'Muslim community'. While some insist that divergences within the 'community' must be recognized, such consciousness of diversities is countered by those who seek to define an inclusive collectivity of Muslims, rejecting the salience of sectarian divisions such as Sunni, Shia and Ishmaili Islam in their own 'community'. For them, banding together is important because Muslims the world over are oppressed. Calling upon the global sense of a Muslim community (the *umma*) thus becomes a source of empowerment (see also Eade, 1993, 1994; Lewis, 1994; Back, 1996; Samad, 1993).

The construction and maintenance of boundaries which sustain religious identities and communities are often critically dependent on the control over religious places, be they schools, mosques, temples or other facilities. This is not a new argument (see, for example, Saifullah-Khan, 1977; Shaw, 1988), but has been given recent anthropological attention, in a manner which geographers would do well to engage in. Two examples will illustrate.

Vertovec's (1992) study of different Hindu temples in London illustrates how members of the Caribbean Hindu society's temple in London use the temple in a completely congregational manner, opening only for collective worship and remaining closed to individual and family-based worship on weekdays; organizing communal activities where food of the Caribbean-Indian variant is served; and reciting prayers congregationally, with the equivalent of church prayer books. The temple therefore becomes a significant means of consolidating and reproducing the Caribbean-Indian-Hindu community. Vertovec argues that this use of the temple has emerged because, in Trinidad and Guyana, Hindus were at the bottom of the social structure and congregational worship provided a sense of mutual support and the maintenance of self-esteem, demonstrating and reinforcing their ethnic identity. When they migrated to Britain, they were still in an ethnic quandary, with the white British population thinking of them derogatorily as 'Paki' (subcontinental Indian); their official 'West Indian' status; and their harsh treatment by south Asians who saw them as a pariah group. For them, community has nothing to do with territory, coming from different parts of London, but everything to do with 'cultural habits and mutual experiences of exclusion' (Vertovec, 1992: 262). By contrast, where the need to consolidate and reinforce identity is not as marked, the temple does not play the important role of a 'community centre'.

The desire to be recognized as a 'community' is also evident among the Hindu population in Edinburgh, as Nye (1993: 201) illustrates:

Nearly all Hindu temples in Britain make use of some type of congregational worship, but only certain temples are equating these congregations with actual communal groups, and in doing so are using the temple to create a sense of Hindu 'community'.

She argues that the notion that Hindus share a common identity and can therefore be considered a 'community' is a discursive construct, because the presence of Hindus in Edinburgh does not necessarily imply the presence of a Hindu community. Neither does the fact that people worship together (a congregation) make them a 'community'. Yet, there is 'common talk' among many sections of the population that they form a 'Hindu community', with a common identity and purpose. This is primarily aided by the fact that the community has a physical manifestation, the Hindu temple. Its construction involved a large degree of time, effort and co-operation among different

groups within the Hindu population, and participation in shaping the temple engendered a sense of community, as the actual process of constructing the temple and negotiating the form of worship involved resolving differences between different groups. A dialectical relationship thus existed between temple and community: the community sustained the temple (they wanted to build it and they put in the effort to build it), and the temple sustained the community: 'By making an appeal to the community to create a temple, they are at the same time constructing a sense of community, and thus also constructing the community itself' (Nye, 1993: 210). Indeed, the temple leaders and the majority of worshippers wanted to participate in collective worship, and to form an obvious and tangible congregation, as opposed to individual worship.

While much of the geographical study of religion in North America has primarily been influenced by the traditional Sauerian school of cultural geography (see Kong, 1990), American geographers Prorok and Hemmasi (1993) take on board issues of cultural politics in their article on Trinidadian mosques, reflecting some of the arguments that have thus far been outlined within anthropology and British cultural geography about the politics of community and the dialectical relationship with place. The authors analyse Muslim politicization through a historical geography of mosque development, arguing that mosques reflect and help resolve the tension between political assimilation and maintenance of ethnic identity among members of the East Indian Muslim community. Mosques disclose the strength of their identity, and the intensity of Muslim participation and assimilation in Trinidad's political history. This is because to (re)build a mosque, the community must organize itself, have good leadership and accumulate resources. To be able to build a mosque then means there is likely to be a strong sense of community spirit. At the same time, mosque building also reflects external political impetuses. Fervent mosque building usually coincided with peak periods when Trinidad's Muslim population was organized for sociopolitical purposes, for example, just before Trinidad gained independence, and leading up to the first elections. Mosque-building activity was particularly strong in a heavily contested area, involving one party dominated by conservative Hindus with no real secular agenda and another, an Afro-Creole party. In this manner, Prorok and Hemmasi (1993) illustrate that mosques contribute to the consolidation and reproduction of communities.

While there appears to be significant recent rapprochement between the larger and more long-standing anthropological literature and the emerging geographical research on the politics of religious communities, what serves to distinguish a geographical perspective is an insistent focus on the dialectical relationship between place and community. Yet, Vertovec's and Nye's work also illustrates the ways in which anthropologists have begun to acknowledge the centrality of spatiality, perhaps reflective of a larger insertion of space in much of social science analysis (see, for example, Hirsch and O'Hanlon, 1995; Perera, 1998; Cieraad, 1999).

5 Bridging the politics and poetics of place, identity and community

As I argued earlier, it is crucial to remember the intersections between the politics and poetics of religious place, identity and community, rather than to treat them as

inherently separate. Most studies that examine the political tend to engage with the issue of how the politics shapes the poetics, thus acknowledging in a sense that all human relations, meanings and practices are grounded in power relations. The reverse, however, is not always true: those who have focused on the poetics of place and community have tended to ignore the politics, perhaps a form of romanticization of sacredness and community.

Two studies illustrate the potential for further research into the ways in which the poetics of religious places may be shaped by political relations. First, in a study of Singapore's religious landscapes, religious adherents are shown to negotiate their conceptions of sacred place within the constraints of larger social and political contexts (Kong, 1993b), adopting various alternative conceptions of the sacred, for example, the view that as long as God is present, there is sacredness, and the place is immaterial; and that sacredness is not exclusive to religious places since God is everywhere. Lane's (1988) work on the Catholic Worker Movement also illustrates the inter-relation between the politics and poetics of place. On the 25th anniversary of the movement's founding of its newspaper, it received notice that its main headquarters was to be torn down to make way for a new subway connection. Instead of engaging in a politics of place, contesting the removal decision, it was considered 'a "sign" from God, a most appropriate gift on our twenty-fifth anniversary. The gift of precarity to insure our permanence' (Lane, 1988: 183). The conception of sacred place is thus situated firmly in and interpreted 'poetically' through nonreligious needs and demands.

Conversely, Jurkovich and Gesler (1997) illustrate how, while there may exist a simultaneous politics and poetics of religious place and experience, only the latter is real and immanent for the individual religious adherent. Pilgrims find 'peace at the heart of conflict' in Medjugorje, the Catholic pilgrimage site in war-torn Bosnia. The conflicts and contestations there include: contests within the Catholic Church (for ecclesiastical territory; conservative versus charismatic), rural-urban contrasts between the pilgrimage site and its surroundings, differences between the sacred and the profane, and the role of the feminine (Mary) in a male-dominated Church (Father-Son-Spirit). Yet, pilgrims also invest their own meanings. Amidst political troubles, and in spite of the fact that pilgrimage had transformed originally bucolic Medjugorje into a busy urban centre (and an unplanned one displaying gross spatial disorder), pilgrims nevertheless saw the place for what it was before: '... many of the pilgrims believe that the real miracle of Medjugorje is their exposure to a way of life they thought no longer existed or was no longer possible: community oriented, nonmaterialistic, rural, devout' (Jurkovich and Gesler, 1997: 459). Amidst such tensions and conflicting meanings, pilgrims created identity through their religion in four ways: by creating community (through commitment to the group and faith in its beliefs as an antidote to the alienation of modern industrialized society); by creating the 'Other' (distinguishing one's self and one's community through loyalty and commitment, for example, pilgrim believers against Moslem Turks and Communists); through rituals (by strengthening group cohesion and excluding others); and through the creation of myths (which perform the same functions as rituals) (Jurkovich and Gesler, 1997: 449). Jurkovich and Gesler's work thus asserts a certain 'poetical' experience amidst politics.

III Conclusions: 'new' geographies of religion

By no means is the above discussion exhaustive of the work by geographers and non-geographers in the 1990s, although I have sought to take into account much of the literature in order to identify key theoretical arguments that have emerged. My intention has been to signal the significant ways by which analyses have proceeded, and now, to draw attention to what else might be given (more) attention to. I will frame this agenda in terms of various differentiations.

First, some of the emerging literature illustrates possibilities of extending the site of analysis, provoking research beyond the 'officially sacred'. Other religious places fully deserve research attention, such as indigenous sacred sites, religious schools, religious organizations and their premises (communal halls), pilgrimage routes (apart from the sites themselves), religious objects, memorials and roadside shrines, domestic shrines, and religious processions and festivals. With technological developments, new religious technological sites also require examination, which may shift the long-standing focus on visual and kinetic to aural/audio experiences and constructions of the sacred (see Kong, forthcoming). There is a need therefore to foreground different sensuous sacred geographies.

Secondly, analytic categories must not be treated as substantive categories. Religion, like class and race, must be a matter for historical and place-specific analysis rather than taken as a priori theory. The ways in which an Irish and a Filipino Catholic, or a rural and metropolitan Manila Catholic, experience and negotiate religious place and experience, must be subject to specific contextual scrutiny (see Williams, 1977: 80–81; Ling, 1987: 11). Curiously, current geographical coverage of critically engaged research has emerged primarily from outside the traditional 'centres', with work about and emerging from places such as Tanzania, Trinidad, Singapore, Finland and Australia, perhaps indicative of a commitment to postcolonial analysis. With some recent exceptions (e.g., Naylor and Ryan, 1998; Dwyer, 1999), most work in the 'centres' has been somewhat less innovative and critically engaged. At the same time, the exceptions in the 'centres' have tended to focus on minority groups (Muslims, Hindus), but there have been few critical attempts to come to grips with large mainline religious groups (often churches) in the USA and the UK. For instance, how have churches been taken into other meaning systems, such as through their conversion to commercial space (e.g., tourist sites); what sorts of conflicts have arisen in the establishment of churches and secular demands for urban space, and how have they been resolved?

Thirdly, the above discussion points to the need for analysis at various scales: global, national, regional, local and, indeed, that of the body. The continuance of religious broadcasting and the emergence of the Internet suggest that certain religious groups have a more global reach than others, exercising influence that is nevertheless mediated by local contexts. Similarly, the reach of transnational religious groups set against the mediations of local forces demands attention, as does the question of how pan-religious identities and communities (e.g., the *umma*) conflict with local and national affiliations. Nagata (1999) argues there is a trend towards religious globalization, characterized, *inter alia*, by a growing convergence and conformity between different religious traditions in which particular religious ideals are sought: regular congregational rituals, adoption of a sacred day a week, a centrality of scriptures and texts, an engagement with secular issues such as human rights, refugees, the environment, and so forth.

These trends lend themselves to the development of a 'global' religious civil society. This phenomenon deserves detailed study. At the same time, with globalization and increasing migration of both highly skilled visible minorities and equally visible 'underbelly' illegal or low-skilled ones, different religious diasporic communities have formed whose experiences deserve research attention. At the other end of the spectrum, the politics and poetics of the local – the school, the mandir, the communal hall, the pilgrimage site – have been examined more frequently, sometimes situated within larger national and even global contexts. More recent attempts at examining embodied geographies (Nast and Pile, 1998) may also offer a fruitful scale for analysis. As Dwyer's (1998) analysis of Muslim women's dressing indicates, the body and, relatedly, dress, is both the expression of dominant ideologies and representations of 'Muslim women' as well as sites of contested cultural representation.

Mention of women directs attention to the fact that there are different geographies for different population constitutions. A fourth way of differentiation that geographical analysis must consider is the way in which religious place holds different meanings and exerts different influences on such different constitutions as women, children, teenagers and the elderly. Their different geographies need to be theorized in different ways. For example, what do public and private spheres mean for and how are they experienced by men and women, children, adults and elderly, and how might these varied experiences and meanings alter conceptions of public and private?

At a theoretical level, there is a need to explore various dialectics, of public and private, politics and poetics, social and spatial. Whereas work clearly needs to be advanced to interrogate public-private dialectics in the context of religious place and experience, I have earlier spotlighted works where analysis of the politics and poetics has been sensitively integrated, and flagged the need for further such analysis. In turn, the intersection of the social and spatial has quite frequently infused current work, a reflection of the firm hold of the society-and-space paradigm in geography in recent years. These works vindicate Wilson's (1993) call to pay attention to how social process and space/place are connected in the geography of religion.

Through yet another lens, differentiation gives way to dedifferentiation as multidisciplinary work creates cross-currents to the extent that it is sometimes difficult to distinguish between contributions from different disciplines. In particular, a rapprochement with anthropology is growing. Perhaps this is a throwback to a long and early relationship (see Wagner and Mikesell, 1962) although more recently, Hirsch and O'Hanlon (1995: 1) have acknowledged that, 'unlike "exchange", "ritual", "history" and other concepts which have figured centrally in anthropological debates . . ., landscape has received little overt anthropological treatment'. Still, the ubiquity of landscape, as of the body (Hirsch and O'Hanlon, 1995: 1) in everyday lives, has prompted anthropologists to give it close attention. In addition, convergences are also sometimes evident with sociology, history, architecture and religious studies (Metcalf, 1996). Indeed, Billinge (1986) has recognized the need to take on board the doctrinal content of religious traditions and not just the geographical impact. This emphasis on theology, not just geography, opens up avenues for collaboration with religious studies (see also Ley, 2000).

Even while this suggests a certain dedifferentiation between the two disciplines, modernity is not exclusively about differentiation or dedifferentiation but can concomitantly reflect both (Heelas, 1998). This is illustrated in the moral turn in geography

(Smith, 1999). Moral geographies (landscapes and locations) have recently become more popular subjects for research (see Matless, 1995: 396–97; Ó Tuathail, 1996: 409–10; Kong, 1999b) and the issue of social justice has attracted more research attention (Smith, 1994; Harvey, 1996). While morality and social justice may exist apart from religion, often, religion is the basis of morality and the impetus for social justice, as well as of intolerance and injustice. Yet, how different religions may inform the constructions of different moral geographies has not been explored, and how these constructed moral geographies contradict or are negotiated or reinforced by other secular agents of morality (for example, the state) requires examination (see Pacione, 1999). In other words, how are competing constructions of good/bad, just/unjust played out in space, between different religious conceptions and between religious and secular conceptions? Such differentiations aside, the dedifferentiation between the secular–sacred boundary as the secular becomes 'less obviously secular' (Heelas, 1998: 3) is also evident in the moral geographies of social movements, some of which have religious undertones. Ecological movements, for example, take certain moral positions about what is good/bad and just/unjust and, while explicitly a secular movement, also approximates an 'implicit religion' (Bartkowski and Swearingen, 1997).

To sum up, in conditions of modernity, 'new' geographies of religion must take on board more actively: 1) different sites of religious practice beyond the 'officially sacred'; 2) different sensuous sacred geographies; 3) different religions in different historical and place-specific contexts; 4) different geographical scales of analysis; 5) different constitutions of population; 6) different dialectics; and 7) different moralities. In as much as such research will refine theoretical understandings of the nature of the sacred (place, identity and community), those with more 'applied' inclinations – whether proselytic (Cooper, 1993), activist (Chouinard, 1994: 5; Warf and Grimes, 1997) or policy oriented (Dunn, 1997) – will find useful insights from further research in 'new' geographies of religion. In the same way that race, class and gender have become primary axes of analyses in geography and other social science disciplines, religion must not be a residual category; one test of this will be the place accorded to religion in future cultural geography books. This is perhaps an appropriate challenge to end with.

Acknowledgements

This article forms part of a research project funded by the National University of Singapore (RP991015). I am grateful to the Association of Commonwealth Universities for the Commonwealth Fellowship which funded my stay at University College London, during which this article was written. I would like to thank Susan Smith for encouraging submission and suggestions, and Claire Dwyer for helpful comments.

Notes

1. On the other hand, beyond geography, a few pieces of work have emerged in recent years which engage with religious places (for example, Holm and Bowker, 1994; Chidester and Linenthal, 1995; Kedar and Werlowsky, 1998 – see later discussion).

2. This is distinct from the differentiations in postmodernity, which also acknowledge the multiplicities of religious inclinations, but which celebrate them (Heelas, 1998).

3. In economic theory, singularization is the opposite of commoditization. Singularizing something 'takes it out of the market dynamics by treating it as precious, by attributing to it so much worth that it is beyond exchange' (Grimes, 1992: 421). When museums purchase objects, they commoditize them momentarily but terminally and, in the museum, the object becomes 'singular, unique, abstracted from its original context, protected from the market' (Grimes, 1992: 421).

4. Wicca is a subbranch of paganism associated with witchcraft.

References

- Anderson, K.** and **Gale, F.**, editors, 1999: *Cultural geographies*. Melbourne: Longman.
- Back, L.** 1996: *New ethnicities and urban culture: racisms and multiculturalism in young lives*. London: UCL Press.
- Bartkowski, J.P.** and **Swearingen, W.S.** 1997: God meets Gaia in Austin, Texas: a case study of environmentalism as implicit religion. *Review of Religious Research* 38, 308–24.
- Baumann, G.** 1996: *Contesting culture: discourses of identity in multi-ethnic London*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bayly, S.** 1989: *Saints, goddesses, and kings. Muslims and Christians in south Indian society, 1700–1900*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bhardwaj, S.M.** 1991: Geography and religion: themes beyond 2001. Paper presented at the Association of American Geographers' meeting, Miami, 15 April (available from the author, sbhardwa@kent/edu).
- Billinge, M.** 1986: Geography of religion. In Johnston, R.J., Gregory, D. and Smith, D.M., editors, *The dictionary of human geography* (2nd edn), Oxford: Blackwell, 403–406.
- Bowman, G.** 1993: Nationalizing the sacred: shrines and shifting identities in the Israeli-occupied territories. *Man* 28, 431–60.
- Campo, J.E.** 1991: *The otherness paradise: an inquiry into the religious meanings of domestic space in Islam*. Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press.
- Carmichael, D.L.**, **Hubert, J.**, **Reeves, B.** and **Schanche, A.**, editors, 1994: *Sacred sites, sacred places*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Chidester, D.** and **Linenthal, E.T.** 1995: Introduction. In Chidester, D. and Linenthal, E.T., editors, *American sacred space*, Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1–42.
- Chouinard, V.** 1994: Reinventing radical geography: is all that's Left Right? *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 12, 2–6.
- Cieraad, I.**, editor, 1999: *At home: an anthropology of domestic space*. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press.
- Cooper, A.** 1992: New directions in the geography of religion. *Area* 24, 123–29.
- 1993: Space and the geography of religion: a rejoinder. *Area* 25, 76–78.
- Crang, M.** 1998: *Cultural geography (Routledge Contemporary Human Geography Series)*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Davies, W.K.D.** and **Herbert, D.** 1993: *Communities within cities: an urban social geography*. London: Belhaven Press.
- Duncan, J.** and **Ley, D.**, editors, 1993: *Place, culture, representation*. London: Routledge.
- Dunn, K.M.** 1997: Cultural geography and cultural policy. *Australian Geographical Studies* 35, 1–11.
- Dwyer, C.** 1998: Contested identities: challenging dominant representations of young British Muslim women. In Skelton, T. and Valentine, G., editors, *Cool places: geographies of youth cultures*, London and New York: Routledge, 50–65.
- 1999: Contradictions of community: questions of identity for young British Muslim women. *Environment and Planning A* 31, 53–68.
- Dwyer, C.** and **Meyer, A.** 1995: The institutionalisation of Islam in The Netherlands and in the UK: the case of Islamic schools. *New Community* 21, 37–54.
- 1996: The establishment of Islamic schools: a controversial phenomenon in three European countries. In Shadid, W.A.R. and van Koningsveld, P.S., editors, *Muslims in the margin: political responses to the presence of Islam in western Europe*, Kampen, The Netherlands: Kok Pharos, 218–42.
- Eade, J.** 1991: Nationalism and the quest for authenticity: the Bangladeshis in Tower Hamlets. *New Community* 16, 493–503.
- 1993: The political articulation of community and the Islamisation of space in London. In Barot, R., editor, *Religion and ethnicity: minorities and social change in the metropolis*, Kampen, The Netherlands: Kok Pharos, 27–42.

- 1994: Identity, nation and religion: educated young Bangladeshi Muslims in London's 'East End'. *International Sociology* 9, 377–94.
- Eade, J. and Sallnow, M.J.**, editors, 1991: *Contesting the sacred: the anthropology of Christian pilgrimage*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Eliade, M.** 1959: *The sacred and the profane: the nature of religion* (translated from French by W.R. Trask). San Diego, CA: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.
- Foote, K.E., Hugill, P.J., Mathewson, K. and Smith, J.M.**, editors, 1994: *Re-reading cultural geography*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.
- Foucault, M.** 1984: Space, knowledge, and power. In Rabinow, P., editor, *The Foucault reader*. New York: Pantheon.
- Friedland, R. and Hecht, R.D.** 1991: The politics of sacred place: Jerusalem's Temple Mount/*al-haram al-sharif*. In Scott, J. and Simpson-Housley, P., editors, *Sacred places and profane spaces: essays in the geographics of Judaism, Christianity and Islam*, Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 21–61.
- Good, A.** 1999: The burning question: sacred and profane space in a south Indian temple town. *Anthropos*, 94 69–84.
- Graham, B.** 1998: Contested images of place among Protestants in Northern Ireland. *Political Geography* 17, 129–44.
- Graham, B. and Murray, M.** 1997: The spiritual and the profane: the pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela. *Ecumene* 4, 389–409
- Grapard, A.G.** 1998: Geotyping sacred space: the case of Mount Hiko in Japan. In Kedar, B.Z. and Werblowsky, R.J. Zwi, editors, *Sacred space: shrine, city, land*, New York: New York University Press, 215–49.
- Griffith, J.S.** 1992: *Beliefs and holy places: a spiritual geography of the Pimeria Alta*. Tucson, AZ: University of Arizona Press.
- Grimes, R.L.** 1992: Sacred objects in museum spaces. *Studies in Religion* 21, 419–30.
- Harley, J.B. and Woodward, D.**, editors, 1994: *The history of cartography. Volume 2, number 2*. Chicago, IL, and London: University of Chicago Press.
- Harvey, D.** 1996: Social justice, postmodernism and the city. In Fainstein, S.S. and Campbell, S., editors, *Readings in urban theory*, Cambridge, MA: Blackwell, 436–43.
- Heelas, P.** 1998: Introduction: on differentiation and dedifferentiation. In Heelas, P., editor, with the assistance of Martin, D. and Morris, P., *Religion, modernity and postmodernity*, Oxford and Malden, MA: Blackwell, 1–18.
- Hertz, R.** 1983 [1913]: Saint Besse: a study of an Alpine cult. In Wilson, S., editor, *Saints and their cults: studies in religious sociology, folklore and history*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 55–100.
- Hillary, G.** 1955: Definitions of community: areas of agreement. *Rural Sociology* 20, 111–23.
- Hirsch, E. and O'Hanlon, M.** 1995: *The anthropology of landscape: perspectives on place and space*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Holm, J. and Bowker, J.**, editors, 1994: *Sacred place*. London: Pinter.
- Hume, L.** 1998: Creating sacred space: outer expressions of inner worlds in modern Wicca. *Journal of Contemporary Religion* 13, 309–19.
- Jackson, P.** 1989: *Maps of meaning: an introduction to cultural geography*. London: Unwin Hyman.
- Jacobs, J.M.** 1993: 'Shake 'im this country': the mapping of the Aboriginal sacred in Australia – the case of Coronation Hill. In Jackson, P. and Penrose, J., editors, *Constructions of race, place and nation*, London: UCL Press; Minneapolis, MN: University of Minneapolis Press, 100–18.
- 1996: *Edge of empire: postcolonialism and the city*. London: Routledge.
- James, W.** 1902: *The varieties of religious experience: a study in human nature*. New York: University Books
- Japhet, S.** 1998: Some biblical concepts of sacred place. In Kedar, B.Z. and Werblowsky, R.J. Zwi, editors, *Sacred space: shrine, city, land*. New York: New York University Press, 55–72.
- Johnson, R.** 1986: The story so far: and further transformations? In Punter, D., editor, *Introduction to contemporary cultural studies*, London: Longman, 277–313.
- Johnston, R.J., Gregory, D. and Smith, D.M.**, editors, 1994: *The dictionary of human geography* (3rd edn), Oxford: Blackwell.
- Jurkovich, J.M. and Gesler, W.M.** 1997: Medjugorje: finding peace at the heart of conflict. *The Geographical Review* 87, 447–67.
- Kedar, B.Z. and Werblowsky, R.J. Zwi**, editors, 1998: *Sacred space: shrine, city, land*. New York: New York University Press.
- Knox, P.** 1995: *Urban social geography: an introduction* (3rd edn). Harlow: Longman.
- Kong, L.** 1990: Geography and religion: trends and prospects. *Progress in Human Geography* 14, 355–71.
- 1992: The sacred and the secular: exploring contemporary meanings and values for religious buildings in Singapore. *Southeast*

- Asian Journal of Social Science* 20, 18–42.
- 1993a: Ideological hegemony and the political symbolism of religious buildings in Singapore. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 11, 23–45.
- 1993b: Negotiating conceptions of sacred space: a case study of religious buildings in Singapore. *Transactions, Institute of British Geographers* 18, 342–58.
- 1995: Review of Chris Park's *Sacred worlds: an introduction to geography and religion*. *Geography of Religion and Belief Systems* 17, 1–3.
- 1999a: Cemeteries and columbaria, memorials and mausoleums: narrative and interpretation in the study of deathscapes in geography. *Australian Geographical Studies* 37, 1–10.
- 1999b: The politics of music in Singapore: moral panics, moral guardians. Paper presented at the Institute of Australian Geographers' Conference, 27 September–1 October, University of Sydney (available from the author, lilykong@nus.edu.sg).
- (forthcoming: Technology in religion and the diminishing of geography? (available from the author, lilykong@nus.edu.sg).
- Lane, B.C.** 1988: *Landscapes of the sacred: geography and narrative in American spirituality*. New York: Paulist Press.
- Leiris, M.** 1938: The sacred in everyday life. Reprinted in translation in Hollier, D., editor, 1988: *The college of sociology 1937–39*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 24–31.
- Lewis, P.** 1994: *Islamic Britain*. London: I.B. Taurus.
- Ley, D.** 2000: Geography of religion. In Johnston, R.J., Gregory, D., Pratt, G. and Watts, M., editors, *The dictionary of human geography* (4th edn), Oxford, MA: Blackwell, 697–99.
- Ling, T.O.** 1987: *Buddhism, Confucianism and the secular state in Singapore: Working Paper* 79. Singapore: Department of Sociology, National University of Singapore.
- Livingstone, D.N.** 1994: Science and religion: foreword to the historical geography of an encounter. *Journal of Historical Geography* 20, 367–83.
- Matless, D.** 1995: Culture run riot? Work in social and cultural geography, 1994. *Progress in Human Geography* 19, 395–403.
- Mazumdar, S. and Mazumdar, S.** 1993: Sacred space and place attachment. *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 13, 231–42.
- McDannell, C.** 1995: Creating the Christian home: home schooling in contemporary America. In Chidester, D. and Linenthal, E.T., editors, *American sacred space*, Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 187–219.
- Metcalf, B.**, editor, 1996: *Making Muslim spaces in North America and Europe*. Berkeley, CA; Los Angeles, CA, and London: University of California Press.
- Michell, G.** 1994: City as cosmogram: the circular plan of Warangal. *National Geographical Journal of India* 40, 217–37.
- Morris, M.S.** 1997: Gardens 'for ever England': landscape, identity and the first world war British cemeteries on the Western Front. *Ecumene* 4, 410–34.
- Murray, M. and Graham, B.** 1997: Exploring the dialectics of route-based tourism: the *Camino de Santiago*. *Tourism Management* 18, 513–24.
- Mythum, H.** 1994: Language as symbol in churchyard monuments: the use of Welsh in nineteenth- and twentieth-century Pembrokeshire. *World Archaeology* 26, 252–67.
- Nagar, R.** 1997: The making of Hindu communal organizations, places, and identities in post-colonial Dar es Salaam. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 15, 707–30.
- Nagata, J.** 1999: The globalisation of Buddhism and the emergence of religious civil society: the case of the Taiwanese Fo Kuang Shan movement in Asia and the west. *Communal/Plural* 7, 231–48.
- Nast, H. and Pile, S.**, editors, 1998: *Places through the body*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Naylor, S.K. and Ryan, J.R.** 1998: Ethnicity and cultural landscapes: mosques, gurdwaras and mandirs in England and Wales. Paper presented at the 'Religion and locality conference', University of Leeds, 8–10 September (available from the first author, simon.Naylor@bristol.ac.uk).
- Nye, M.** 1993: Temple congregations and communities: Hindu constructions in Edinburgh. *New Community* 19, 201–15.
- Otto, R.** 1917: *The idea of the holy* (translated by J.W. Harvey) (2nd edn). London: Oxford University Press.
- Ó Tuathail, G.** 1996: Political geography II: (counter) revolutionary times. *Progress in Human Geography* 20, 404–12.
- Pacione, M.** 1999: The relevance of religion for a relevant human geography. *Scottish Geographical Journal* 115, 117–31.
- Pan, D.** 1995: Decoding Sharawadgi: Taoist influence on the Chinese landscape garden.

- Landscape Research* 20, 11–18.
- Park, C.** 1994: *Sacred worlds: an introduction to geography and religion*, London and New York: Routledge.
- Perera, N.** 1998: *Society and space: colonialism, nationalism, and postcolonial identity in Sri Lanka*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Philp, J. and Mercer, D.** 1999: Commodification of Buddhism in contemporary Burma. *Annals of Tourism Research* 26, 21–54.
- Prorok, C.V.** 1994: Hindu temples in the western world: a study in social space and ethnic identity. *Geographia Religio* 8, 95–108.
- Prorok, C.V. and Hemmasi, M.** 1993: East Indian Muslims and their mosques in Trinidad: a geography of religious structures and the politics of ethnic identity. *Caribbean Geography* 4, 28–48.
- Raivo, P.J.** 1997a: Comparative religion and geography: some remarks on the geography of religion and religious geography. *Temenos* 33, 137–49.
- 1997b: The limits of tolerance: the Orthodox milieu as an element in the Finnish cultural landscape, 1917–1939. *Journal of Historical Geography* 23, 327–39.
- Rath, J., Groenendijk, K. and Penninx, R.** 1991: The recognition and institutionalisation of Islam in Belgium, Great Britain and The Netherlands. *New Community* 18, 101–14.
- Saifullah-Khan, V.** 1977: The Pakistanis: Mirpuri villagers at home and in Bradford. In Watson, J., editor, *Between two cultures*, Oxford: Blackwell, 57–89.
- Samad, Y.** 1998: Imagining a British Muslim identification. In Vertovec, S. and Rogers, A., editors, *Muslim European youth: reproducing ethnicity, religion, culture*, Aldershot: Ashgate, 59–76.
- Shaw, A.** 1988: *A Pakistani community in Britain*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Shirlow, P. and McGovern, M.** 1998: Language, discourse and dialogue: Sinn Fein and the Irish peace process. *Political Geography* 17, 171–86.
- Shurmer-Smith, P. and Hannam, K.** 1994: *Worlds of desire, realms of power: a cultural geography*. London and New York: Edward Arnold.
- Silk, J.** 1999: The dynamics of community, place, and identity. *Environment and Planning A* 31, 5–17.
- Singh, R.P.B.** 1994: The sacred geometry of India's Holy City, Varanasi: Kashi as cosmogram. *National Geographical Journal of India* 40, 189–216.
- Sinha, A.** 1995a: Guest editorial: landscapes of religion. *Landscape Research* 20, 1–2.
- 1995b: Nature in Hindu art, architecture and landscape. *Landscape Research* 20, 3–10.
- Smith, D.** 1994: *Geography and social justice*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- 1999: Geography, community, and morality. *Environment and Planning A* 31, 19–35.
- Smith, J.Z.** 1978: The wobbling pivot. In Smith, J.Z., editor, *Map is not territory: studies in the history of religions*, Leiden: E.J. Brill, 88–103.
- Sopher, D.** 1981: Geography and religion. *Progress in Human Geography* 5, 510–24.
- Stump, R.W.** 1991: Spatial implications of religious broadcasting: stability and change in patterns of belief. In Brunn, S. and Leinbach, T., editors, *Collapsing space and time: geographic aspects of communications and information*, London: HarperCollins Academic, 354–75.
- Tuan, Y.F.** 1976: Humanistic geography. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 66, 266–76.
- Turner, V.** 1974: *Dramas, fields, and metaphors: symbolic action in human society*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- van der Leeuw, G.** 1986 [1933]: *Religion in essence and manifestation*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Vertovec, S.** 1992: Community and congregation in London Hindu temples: divergent trends. *New Community* 18, 251–64.
- Wagner, P. and Mikesell, M.**, editors, 1962: *Readings in cultural geography*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Warf, B. and Grimes, J.** 1997: Counterhegemonic discourses and the Internet. *Geographical Review* 87, 259–74.
- Wescoat, J.L. Jr** 1995: From the gardens of the Qur'an to the 'gardens of Lahore'. *Landscape Research*, 20, 19–29.
- Wheatley, P.** 1971: *The pivot of the four quarters: a preliminary enquiry into the origins and character of the Chinese city*. Chicago, IL: Aldine.
- Williams, R.** 1977: *Marxism and literature*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Wilson, D.** 1993: Connecting social process and space in the geography of religion. *Area* 25, 75–76.
- Woodward, D. and Lewis, G.M.**, editors, 1992: *The history of cartography. Volume 2, number 1*. Chicago, IL, and London: University of Chicago Press.
- , editors, 1998: *The history of cartography. Volume 2, number 3*. Chicago, IL, and London: University of Chicago Press.

Young, I.M. 1990a: The ideal of community and the politics of difference. In Nicholson, L.J., editor, *Feminism/postmodernism*, London:

Routledge, 300–23.

—— 1990b: *Justice and the politics of difference*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.